

## **Animals' Angels Investigation of the Slaughter Horse Export in Presidio, TX**

**Date:**

3/6/12-3/7/12

**Locations:**

Alvarado/C4 Pens  
Cattle Drive, Presidio, TX

**Pen Management:**

C4 Cattle Company  
4149 County Rd 133  
Burlington, TX 76519



*C4 Holding Pens*

The C4 Cattle Company leases the pens. William J. Crenan is the registered agent for C4 Cattle and in charge of the pens. Manuel Molinar is the pen operator for C4.

**Export Facility:**

Inter Meats, S.A. DE C.V.  
Avenida Universidad 602 Int. 19 Unidad Ganadera  
Aguascalientes, AGS. Mexico 20130

The C4 pens export slaughter horses to the Inter Meats plant in Aguascalientes. According to numbers provided to TCEQ, they ship approximately 5,475 horses/year. Inter Meats or “Dallas/Mexico Crown” is linked to the Belgium based company Chevideco, which imports the meat from the Aguascalientes plant to Europe. ([www.chevideco.com](http://www.chevideco.com))

**Additional Information:**

The investigation was triggered by the events that took place in Presidio in 2011.

Photos recently provided to Animals' Angels showed that horses were dying in the C4 pens without human intervention. In August of 2011, there were approximately 350 horses on the property and photos show several horses down and dying. Many were extremely emaciated (BCS 1) or had open, untreated wounds. All horses had no shelter and no protection from the desert sun.

Signed eye witness statements claim that horses were being denied food & water. The statement also talks about "non-ambulatory horses laying in puddles of mud and urine" and dying.

The bodies of many of the horses that died on the property were being dumped in a dry creek bed on an adjacent property.

**Examples of horses dying at the C4 pens with no euthanasia provided:**

(All photographs provided by anonymous source; all photographs taken between 8/12/11-8/18/11)

1)



2)



3)



4)



5)



*Horse had to be down struggling for quite some time judging by the deep trenches in the ground*

**Examples of non-ambulatory horses (Newspaper was used to document date):**



After cruelty complaints from animal welfare advocates on 8/15/11, the Presidio County Sheriff's Department supposedly launched an investigation. All evidence was submitted to the Sheriff's Department, including pictures taken at the C4 pens and the signed complaints. On 8/19/11, the Sheriff's Department removed 27 horses from the C4 pens. At the same time, the Texas Department of Environmental Quality (TCEQ) was called to investigate the illegal disposal of horse carcasses along the creek.

**Animals' Angels Investigation:**

Animals' Angels requested a case status update and all information about any prior investigations of the C4 pens from the Presidio County Sheriff's Office as well as the TCEQ. Additionally, FOIA requests regarding horse shipments were submitted to USDA.

**The TCEQ request revealed the following:**

- TCEQ was aware of dead horses being dumped by C4 since **October 15, 2010** and launched their first investigation on October 28, 2010. (Investigation # 872212) Over ten carcasses were found and a notice of violation (NOV) was issued.
- TCEQ received the next complaint about C4 dumping dead horses on private property on **June 8, 2011**. An investigation was conducted on 6/15/11 and again on 7/21/11. (Investigation # 933240) Eleven horse carcasses were found, six of them had a readable microchip. One horse was branded with a blue "D", indicating that it had been delivered to the pens by Dorian Ayache and was rejected by Mexican authorities. Paperwork obtained from the C4 pens also showed that the following kill buyers all had delivered horses to the C4 pens:

Dorian Ayache (TN), Bill Richardson (TX), Joe Rios (TX), Trent Saulters (TX), Dennis Kunz (UT), Ryon Simon (MN), Double JJ Horse Company (OK) and Triple Crown Ranch (OK). A notice of enforcement (NOE) was issued



- TCEQ received the next complaint on **August 11, 2011**. An investigation was conducted on 8/17/11 and approx. 35 horse carcasses were found. TCEQ states in the investigation report that “The cause of death of these horses remains unknown and should be further investigated by the appropriate agency having jurisdiction in this matter.”

- TCEQ informed us that the entire case file was currently under “Management Review” and therefore not available to the public. It is therefore unknown at this point what the status of the enforcement action is and if any fines have been assessed.

**The USDA request revealed the following:**

Owner/shipper paperwork confirms that all the individuals mentioned in the TCEQ investigation deliver a significant number of horses to the C4 pens. The paperwork also showed that both Jim Crenan and the C4 Cattle Company do not only run the export pens, but are actively engaged in shipping horses to Mexico and are listed as owner/shippers.

**The request to the Presidio County Sheriff's Office revealed the following:**

- According to the answers Animals' Angels received in response to our FOIA request, there are no records of any cruelty investigation ever being initiated against C4. Apparently, there are also no records of the submitted complaints.

- The Sheriff's Department did provide some documents about an investigation into the illegal dumping of carcasses. Landfill records show that in June, July and August of 2011 C4 delivered close to 50 horse carcasses/month to the landfill for disposal.

Why did the Presidio County Sheriff's Office apparently never initiate a cruelty investigation, despite the fact that formal complaints had been filed and even TCEQ recommended an investigation? The photographic evidence of horses being down and then dying without human intervention does not leave much room to dispute cruel and inhumane treatment.

Deputy Sheriff Nunez confirmed in earlier emails (8/15/11) to the complainant that 2 cruelty investigations were ongoing, but never provided a case number. How can there be a cruelty case but no records?

It is the responsibility of C4 director Jim Crenan to ensure that all horses on his premises receive the minimum standard of care the law requires. The fact that these horses are slaughter horses does not exclude them from the protection of the law. It also does not matter if these horses were already brought to the pens in bad condition.

Once the pen accepts the animals, they become the pens responsibility and as such have to be provided with food, water and care. Dying horses have to be euthanized humanely and not just left in the pens to die a slow and horrible death.

**Texas Penal Code § 42.09. Cruelty to Livestock Animals**

(a) A person commits an offense if the person intentionally or knowingly:

- (1) tortures a livestock animal;
- (2) fails unreasonably to provide necessary food, water, or care for a livestock animal in the person's custody;

**Texas Health and Safety of Animals § 821.021. Definition**

In this subchapter:

- (1) "Cruelly treated" includes tortured, seriously overworked, unreasonably abandoned, unreasonably deprived of necessary food, care, or shelter, cruelly confined, or caused to fight with another animal
- (3) "Owner" includes a person who owns or has custody or control of an animal

**Recent investigation in Presidio:**

3/6/12

2:10 pm: Investigators observed a truck and empty trailer owned by Dennis Chinn parked across the road from the C4 pens. (USDOT 279114, Pratt, KS)



*Three Angels Farms*



*Dennis Chinn*

2:30 pm: A Three Angels Farms truck was observed backed to the chute and unloading horses (USDOT 2100311 Dorian Ayache, Lebanon, TN)

Both trucking companies have multiple violations:

**Dennis Chinn:**

Unsafe Driving (3 violations) most recent: 10/27/10 NM3536101898

Fatigued Driving Violations (2 violations) most recent: 8/16/10 TX106C0EGH03

**Three Angels Farms:**

Unsafe Driving (1 violation) most recent: 1/17/12 TNTBTO000587

Fatigued Driving Violations (7 violations) most recent: 1/17/12 TNTBTO000587  
 Driver Fitness Violations (1 violation) most recent: 6/3/11 TX114A0FBW02  
 Vehicle Maintenance Violations (31 violations) most recent: 2/3/12 US0856000456  
 Crash with injury (1 vehicles involved, 1 injury, 1 towed) 10/10/11 TN Report TN0100103111

The Three Angels Farm Truck was involved in a tragic accident in January of 2012, when the trailer loaded with 38 horses overturned. 3 horses died. <http://www.wkcr.com/story/16531100/overtuned-cattle-truck-closes-both-directions-of-i-40>

4:17 pm: 2 Three Angels Farms truck/trailers were parked at a Presidio hotel empty.



*Loose boards on trailer sides, holes and exposed screws put horses at risk*



*Broken & Missing overhead piping put horses at risk of severe injuries*

**3/7/12**

9:00 am to 10:00 am

Investigators observed the C4 pens from the air via helicopter. Water was available to all horses. However, horses inside C4 still had no shelter and only very small amounts of hay were observed. Some pens had no food at all. Two dead horses were visible inside the pens. Several horses were thin.



*Dead horse in pen area*

A Wrangler Grain truck was backed to chute, unloading horses. (9:15am) 40 minutes later, the empty truck left and then parked at a Presidio hotel. (USDOT 1516049, Mount Pleasant, TX 75455)

11:40 am: An empty Robert Jackson truck and trailer is seen parked across the road from C4. (USDOT 1800541, Marietta, OK 73448)

12:50 pm: Investigators observed C4's green pick-up truck with flat trailer carrying two dead horses waiting outside the landfill. Investigators believe their flyover to be the catalyst for C4's removal of the horses, as they had already been dead for quite some time. The bloated bay mare (slaughter tag not visible) was observed during the flyover in the pens. Its legs were stiff and extended, and her neck and head were hanging off the side of the trailer. Her anus had been eaten by scavengers. The chestnut horse was extremely thin, hip bones very visible, her anus was also eaten by scavengers. No bullet holes were observed. (USDA Slaughter Tag # 2744)



1:09 pm: Investigators observed the truck and flatbed inside the landfill after dumping the horse carcasses. Landfill workers immediately began covering the horses using a bobcat. Landfill workers approached the investigators with some hostility. Investigators left the scene approximately 1:15 pm and drive to the border crossing & the broker lot.



Meanwhile, the temperature had risen to 93 degrees Fahrenheit. 2 Mexican horse slaughter transport trailers were parked in the broker lot, which is approx. 0.5 miles away from the border. One of the trailers was empty, but the other one was already loaded with horses, and the truck had been removed (trailer is parked without semi). The open roof trailers appeared to be new and the sides were much higher than all others observed during earlier investigations, which eliminates the danger of horses getting caught with their heads in between the metal pipes.



However, the trailer sides can be closed completely. When the sides are closed, it is impossible to even tell that there are live animals inside the trailer.

1:49 pm: A white “Sagarpa-Senasica” (Mexican Veterinary Inspection Service) truck left the border and drove to the pens and returned 20 minutes later.

2:55 pm: At the border crossing, 2 completely boarded Mexican horse slaughter transport trucks/trailers loaded with horses waited to cross border. (DOT: 00556446; Autotransportes de Candos, Camargo, Chihuahua) The drivers entered the office to have their paperwork checked.



*Trucks waiting to cross border with completely closed sides*

The fact that the sides were closed completely is very concerning. How is the driver checking the horses during transit? Additionally, no airflow is possible through the closed trailer sides, which causes increased temperatures inside the trailer – especially when it is parked.

3:21 pm: Both Mexican transport trucks/trailers crossed into Mexico.



3:30 pm: 2 loaded trailers were still waiting at the broker lot.

4:36 pm: Double decker, with horses loaded on one level, entered broker lot. (DOT: 557589, Transportes Javier R. Aguirre) Driver went inside broker office, and immediately returned taking the load across the border.

5:13 pm: Both transport trailers are still parked in the broker lot.



**Conclusion:**

While there have been positive changes at C4 in that no horse carcasses were seen in the adjacent property near the dry river bed, and disposal seems to be occurring at the landfill, there remain unresolved issues. The horses still have no shelter and protection from the desert sun. It is also questionable that the horses at C4 receive enough food, since several pens had no hay at all and other pens had only very small quantities. It is also fact that horses continue to die at C4 and that the carcasses are not immediately removed from the pen area.

Additionally, based on the information provided by the Presidio Sheriff's Office, it appears that the slow deaths of multiple horses in 2011 were never investigated and that no charges were filed against C4 for cruelty to animals. The status of the TCEQ case remains unavailable to the public for an unknown period of time due to "management review".

Lastly, the transport trailers & procedures observed in Presidio are unacceptable. Both, Ayache's broken up trailer as well as the completely closed up Mexican trailers should not be allowed to transport horses. Animals' Angels has brought this to the attention of the USDA slaughter horse program and they have promised to investigate further.